



WATERFRONTToronto

Digital Strategy Advisory Panel - Meeting # 9

MONDAY, APRIL 1, 2019 FROM 11:00AM TO 5:00PM

WATERFRONT TORONTO

20 BAY STREET, SUITE 1310

TORONTO, ON, M5J 2N8



WATERFRONToronto

Meeting Book - Digital Strategy Advisory Panel - Meeting # 9

11:00 - 11:05	1. Opening Session a. Call to Order		
	a. Call to Order		M. Geist
	b. Approval of Agenda	Approval	All
	Agenda - Page 4		
	c. Declarations of Conflict of Interest	All	
	d. Approval of Previous Minutes	Approval	All
	i. February 14, 2019		
	Draft Minutes - DSAP Meeting February 14, 2019 - Page 6		
11:05 - 11:15	2. New Panelist Welcome	Information	All
11:15 - 11:20	3. Chair's Remarks		M. Geist
11:20 - 11:30	4. Management Report	Information	K. Verner
	Management Report - Page 10		
11:30 - 12:00	5. Working Group Reports		
	a. Governance	Information	
	b. Architecture	Information	
	c. Criteria	Information	
12:00 - 12:15	6. Overview of Process on Sidewalk Labs Review	Information	K. Verner
	DSAP Role in Evaluation - Page 14		
12:15	7. Motion to go into closed session	Approval	All
	The Panel will discuss the matters outlined in Item 6i, being Confidential Draft Briefing of Digital Innovation Materials, in a Closed Session as permitted by By-Law No. 2 of the Corporation. The exception relied for the discussion of Item 6i in Closed Session is Section 6.1.1(l) of By-Law No. 2. The Panel will continue in Open Session at the end of the Closed Session to discuss and vote on any resolutions pertaining to the Closed Session.		
4:50	11. Motion to go into Open Session	All	Approval
4:50 - 4:55	12. Resolutions Arising from the Closed Session (if any)	Approval	All
5:00	13. Adjournment	Approval	All

**WATERFRONT TORONTO DIGITAL STRATEGY ADVISORY PANEL
MEETING #9 - AGENDA**

April 1, 2019 -11:00am - 5:00pm
Waterfront Toronto Boardroom
20 Bay Street, Suite 1320 Toronto, Ontario M5J 2N8

11:00 - 11:05	1. Opening Session a. Call to Order b. Approval of Agenda c. Declarations of Conflict of Interest d. Approval of Previous Minutes i. February 14, 2019	Approval Approval	M. Geist All All All
11:05 - 11:15	2. New Panelist Welcome	Information	All
11:15 - 11:20	3. Chair's Remarks		M. Geist
11:20 - 11:30	4. Management Report	Information	K. Verner
11:30 - 12:00	5. Working Group Reports a. Governance b. Architecture c. Criteria	Information Information Information	
12:00 - 12:15	6. Overview of Process on Sidewalk Labs Review	Information	K. Verner
12:15	7. Motion to go into closed session	Approval	All
	The Panel will discuss the matters outlined in Item 6i, being Confidential Draft Briefing of Digital Innovation Materials, in a Closed Session as permitted by By-Law No. 2 of the Corporation. The exception relied for the discussion of Item 6i in Closed Session is Section 6.1.1(l) of By-Law No. 2. The Panel will continue in Open Session at the end of the Closed Session to discuss and vote on any resolutions pertaining to the Closed Session.		
12:15 - 12:30	Break		
12:30 - 2:00	8. Waterfront Toronto Overview of Materials	Information & Discussion	K. Verner V. Lockton G. Takach C. Bernier
2:00- 2:10	Break		
2:10 - 4:10	9. Sidewalk Labs Material Walkthrough & Panelist Questions	Information & Discussion	A. Harvey Dawson C. Nevill-Manning P. Ramaswami

4:10 - 4:45	10. Panel Advice to Waterfront Toronto	Discussion	All
4:50	11. Motion to go into Open Session	Approval	All
4:50 - 4:55	12. Resolutions Arising from the Closed Session (if any)	Approval	All
5:00	13. Adjournment	Approval	All

**WATERFRONT TORONTO
DIGITAL STRATEGY ADVISORY PANEL
MEETING #8 - MINUTES**

February 14, 2019 - 1:00pm - 4:00pm

Video Archive of Meeting: <https://youtu.be/Kx-YOTCmEBU>

PANELISTS: Michael Geist
Charles Finley
Jutta Treviranus (remote)
Kevin Tuer
Mark Wilson
Carlo Ratti (remote)

Andrew Clement
Teresa Scassa (remote)
Pamela Robinson
Dave Dame
Alaina Aston

REGRETS: None

WATERFRONT TORONTO MANAGEMENT & EXTERNAL LEGAL:

Kristina Verner
Chantal Bernier (remote)
George Takach

GUESTS:

Prem Ramaswami	Sidewalk Labs
Craig Nevill-Manning	Sidewalk Labs
Alyssa Harvey Dawson	Sidewalk Labs

1a. CALL TO ORDER

Being a quorum of Panelists present, the meeting was called to order at 1:08 p.m. Dr. Michael Geist, Chairman of the Panel, presided as Chairman of the meeting.

1b. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

On a motion made by Mark Wilson, seconded by Kevin Tuer, it was resolved to approve the agenda for the meeting. Motion Carried.

1c. DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST

No new conflicts of interest were registered.

1d. APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS NOTES

On a motion made by Dave Dame, seconded by Kevin Tuer, it was resolved to approve the notes from the meeting on January 17, 2019 as amended by panelists. Motion Carried.

2. CHAIR'S REMARKS

Dr. Geist provided opening remarks to the panelists. Sli.do continued to be used as a tool to help coordinate comments and questions during the session.

3. MANAGEMENT REPORT

Data trust primer - The primer was published January 18, 2019. The primer is a living document, so continued input is welcome.

DSAP new member recruitment - 14 applications received and reviewed.

Manager, Digital Governance - The interview process for the short-listed group of applicants is complete; update to be provided in closed session.

Civic Labs - The Civic Labs exploring the notion of a Civic Digital Trust, originally scheduled for February 13, 2019 was rescheduled to March 4, 2019 due to weather. The following Civic Labs session will be held March 26, 2019 focused on data ownership, monetization and shared benefits.

Stakeholder Advisory Committee - Session to be held February 26, 2019 focusing on technology proposals from Sidewalk Labs.

Ontario Government Data Consultation - The Ontario Government launched the first phase of its data strategy consultation on February 5, 2019 and has reached out to Waterfront Toronto to provide input.

4. SIDEWALK LABS TECHNOLOGY UPDATE

After a recap of the prior meeting's presentation, Prem Ramaswami, Craig Nevill-Manning and Alyssa Harvey Dawson presented on three primary topic areas: end-to-end data use case examples, the use of open standards, and digital accessibility principles. Additional details are available through the slides provided in the meeting book.

The presenters stated that Sidewalk's understanding of what parties would be developing and operating various elements of the urban digital architecture has been, and will continue to, evolve. They also noted that product development is early in the process, and the presentation reflects current thinking.

Product Development Cycle - Prior to presenting on specific technologies, a description was given of Sidewalk Labs' product development cycle. This cycle involves four phases in two primary stages: Discovery (involving the Ideation and Definition phases), and Delivery (the Iterative Design and Implementation phases). Privacy by Design is incorporated into the Ideation phase. Additional details are available through the slides in the meeting book.

Panelists raised questions around how Sidewalk was integrating public engagement into the product development process, noting that more interactions would be necessary than for a typical product. Panelists also questioned at what technological layer (architectural, platform, or sensor/product) engagements were taking place, and how Sidewalk determined on which “pain points” they would focus their engagements. They wondered whether a roadmap, interactive dashboard or other central tool existed or could be created to show what products were currently being considered (and what feedback was being requested/had been provided). Throughout this discussion, Sidewalk stated that they had undertaken significant public consultation through a variety of means, as would be described in the MIDP. They stated that they were still seeking the best balance between engagement during development and testing. Lastly, they noted that the MIDP would describe all of the technologies currently being considered.

Real-time Measurement to Improve Mobility - P. Ramaswami then described the Numina pilot currently underway at 307. Additional details are available through the slides provided in the meeting book. Panelists commented that problems in an urban environment are complex, and positive outcomes often cannot be simplified into a single goal such as ‘increased mobility.’ Technological solutions will not always be the best approach. Panelists also raised questions about re-identification of data in the system, particularly when under pressure from law enforcement during emergency events (such as Amber Alerts), and the public accessibility of de-identified data. Sidewalk noted that they are alert to many of these issues, and they are answers that either need to be worked through or would not be determined by Sidewalk. They also noted that there is on-going internal discussion between the urbanists and technologists at Sidewalk; the information presented here is more focused on technology given the nature of the Panel.

Open Standards: Skipping the second data use case contained in the slides, Craig Nevill-Manning then presented on Open Standards - in particular, the benefits of making open data available in standard formats via standard interfaces. Sidewalk will support existing standards and solutions where they exist, and where needed, develop new formats and means of access with as broad a range of partners as possible. Cost, Governance and Access proposals for standardized open data were also described. However, it was also noted that the presented information is an over-simplification, focus more on goals than specific solutions. See the slides in the meeting book for further detail. Panelists asked clarifying questions including around the relationship between open data and the proposed Civic Data Trust, and highlighted the cost associated with governance of this data. Sidewalk clarified that there is not consensus around intended models of data openness.

Sidewalk stated that it would provide readings to the Panel around the Estonia model.

5. MOTION TO GO INTO CLOSED SESSION

On a motion made by Mark Wilson, seconded by Charles Finley, the Panel moved into closed session to discuss the MIDP evaluation process.

6. MOTION TO GO INTO OPEN SESSION

On a motion made by Pamela Robinson, seconded by Mark Wilson, the Panel moved into open session. Motion carried.

7. MIDP REVIEW ROLE AND PROCESS

Kristina Verner stated that on potential feedback protocols from the Panelists. It was noted that it will be permissible and beneficial for the panel to have a diversity of views on the MIDP and its individual components; Panelists are not expected to reach a single consensus. As well, it was noted that the ultimate feedback product produced by the Panel would be made public, though private working sessions may encourage more candid feedback. The goal, though, would remain to maximise public input. Waterfront will, though, defer to the Panel on their preferred methodology for the review.

8. MOTION TO GO INTO CLOSED SESSION

On a motion made by David Dame, seconded by Kevin Tuer, the Panel moved into closed session to confidentiality agreements for the MIDP chapter.

9. MOTION TO GO INTO OPEN SESSION

On a motion made by Kevin Tuer, seconded by Dave Dame, the Panel moved into open session. Motion carried.

10. ADJOURNMENT

On a motion made by Mark Wilson, seconded by Andrew Clement, and carried unanimously, it was agreed that there was no further business of the Panel to transact, the meeting was closed at 4:45 p.m.

APRIL 1, 2019

Management Report

Kristina Verner, Vice President, Innovation, Sustainability & Prosperity

Developments since February 14, 2018

Standing Committee on Access to Information, Privacy and Ethics – February 21, 2019

Working Group Meetings

- *Panel Governance & Nomination – March 15, 2019*
- *Architecture – March 25, 2019*
- *Evaluation Criteria – April 12, 2019*

Civic Digital Literacy

- *Info Sheets – Social media campaign has continued*
- *Civic Labs*
 - *Civic Lab #2: Civic Digital Trusts held March 4, 2019*
 - *Civic Lab #3: Data Ownership, Monetization & Shared Benefits held March 26, 2019*

DSAP New Panelist Recruitment – 3 new panelists selected.

Manager, Digital Governance – Onboarding has been complete.

Additional External Legal Counsel on Intellectual Property Matters

Forecast: Public Consultation on Digital Issues

- *A full scale public consultation on digital issues is currently being planned for mid-May 2019.*

Thank you.

Waterfront Toronto
20 Bay Street, Suite 1310
Toronto, ON M5J 2N8
www.waterfrontoronto.ca

Join Waterfront Toronto on social media





a waterfront for everyone



Role of DSAP in the Evaluation Process

Digital Strategy Advisory Panel Meeting
April 1, 2019

Key Elements of the DSAP Review



The Digital Strategy Advisory Panel will be providing its review and comments to the following pillars:

- Digital Innovation
- Volume III: Intellectual Property

In the case of the Digital Innovation pillar, DSAP is serving as the Subject Matter Expert.

Working groups of the DSAP are currently working on independent architecture models and providing input to the evaluation criteria to ensure they are comprehensive.

DSAP will receive a confidential briefing and preliminary draft of the Digital Innovation chapter in April 2019 to begin their due diligence process, providing high-level feedback to Waterfront Toronto to identify areas of concern.

DSAP will not be providing a scored review of the MIDP, but rather providing comprehensive comments that will form the basis of a consensus report, and as appropriate, a minority report, that will be factored into the pillar review and evaluation. This report will become public as part of DSAP's overall commitment to openness and transparency.

2019–2020 DSAP Dates



- Monday, April 1, 2019: 11:00 am – 5:00 pm
- Thursday, June 6, 2019: 1:00 pm – 5:00 pm
 - Additional meetings will be scheduled to discuss the MIDP contents once the public release schedule is finalized.
- Thursday, September 12, 2019: 1:00 pm – 5:00 pm
- Thursday, November 7, 2019: 1:00 pm – 5:00 pm
- Thursday, January 23, 2020: 1:00 pm – 5:00 pm
- Thursday, March 12, 2020: 1:00 pm – 5:00 pm



a waterfront for everyone

